

January 24, 2005

Mr. C. Stephen Hughes Assistant District Attorney 27<sup>th</sup> Judicial District P. O. Box 540 Belton, Texas 76513-0540

OR2005-00665

## Dear Mr. Hughes:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 217450.

The District Attorney for the 27th Judicial District of Texas, Bell County (the "district attorney") received a request for information pertaining to a specified case. You claim that the requested information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.108, 552.111, 552.130, 552.134, and 552.136 of the Government Code.¹ We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Initially, we note the submitted information includes a supporting affidavit for an arrest warrant. Article 15.26 of the Code of Criminal Procedure states "[t]he arrest warrant, and any affidavit presented to the magistrate in support of the issuance of the warrant, is public information." Crim. Proc. Code art. 15.26. As a general rule, the exceptions to disclosure found in the Act do not apply to information that is made public by other statutes. See Open Records Decision Nos. 623 at 3 (1994), 525 at 3 (1989). Therefore, if the affidavit that we have marked was presented to a magistrate in support of the issuance of an arrest warrant,

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup>We note that you raise section 552.305 of the Government Code as an exception to disclosure. Section 552.305 states in relevant part that "[i]n a case in which information is requested under this chapter and a person's privacy or property interests may be involved . . . a governmental body may decline to release the information for the purpose of requesting an attorney general decision." Gov't Code § 552.305 (emphasis added). Thus, section 552.305 does not except information from public disclosure under the Act. Rather, section 552.305 is a procedural provision permitting a governmental body to withhold information that may be private while the governmental body is seeking an attorney general's decision under the Act.

then the affidavit must be released under article 15.26 of the Code of Criminal Procedure. If the affidavit was not so presented, then it must be disposed of in accordance with the rest of this ruling.

Section 552.101 excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Section 261.201(a) of the Family Code provides as follows:

- (a) The following information is confidential, is not subject to public release under Chapter 552, Government Code, and may be disclosed only for purposes consistent with this code and applicable federal or state law or under rules adopted by an investigating agency:
  - (1) a report of alleged or suspected abuse or neglect made under this chapter and the identity of the person making the report; and
  - (2) except as otherwise provided in this section, the files, reports, records, communications, and working papers used or developed in an investigation under this chapter or in providing services as a result of an investigation.

Fam. Code § 261.201(a). Because the requested information consists of files, reports, records, communications, or working papers used or developed in an investigation under chapter 261, the information is within the scope of section 261.201 of the Family Code. You have not indicated that the district attorney has adopted a rule that governs the release of this type of information. Therefore, we assume that no such regulation exists. Given that assumption, we conclude that most of the remaining submitted information must be withheld from the requestor under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 261.201 of the Family Code. See Open Records Decision No. 440 at 2 (1986) (addressing statutory predecessor).

We note, however, that the submitted information includes fingerprints. The public availability of this information is governed by sections 560.001, 560.002, and 560.003 of the Government Code. These sections provide as follows:

## Sec. 560.001. DEFINITIONS. In this chapter:

- (1) "Biometric identifier" means a retina or iris scan, fingerprint, voiceprint, or record of hand or face geometry.
- (2) "Governmental body" has the meaning assigned by Section 552.003 [of the Government Code], except that the term includes each entity within or created by the judicial branch of state government.

Sec. 560.002. DISCLOSURE OF BIOMETRIC IDENTIFIER. A governmental body that possesses a biometric identifier of an individual:

- (1) may not sell, lease, or otherwise disclose the biometric identifier to another person unless:
  - (A) the individual consents to the disclosure;
  - (B) the disclosure is required or permitted by a federal statute or by a state statute other than Chapter 552 [of the Government Code]; or
  - (C) the disclosure is made by or to a law enforcement agency for a law enforcement purpose; and
- (2) shall store, transmit, and protect from disclosure the biometric identifier using reasonable care and in a manner that is the same as or more protective than the manner in which the governmental body stores, transmits, and protects its other confidential information.

Sec. 560.003. APPLICATION OF CHAPTER 552. A biometric identifier in the possession of a governmental body is exempt from disclosure under Chapter 552.

Gov't Code §§ 560.001, 560.002, 560.003. These sections are intended to protect the privacy of a living individual to whom a fingerprint or other biometric identifier pertains. See id. § 560.002(1)(a). In this instance, the requestor identifies herself as an attorney for the individual to whom the submitted fingerprints pertain. Furthermore, the requestor has submitted the individual's written consent to the release of information concerning himself to the requestor. Consequently, we find that the requestor has a right of access to the submitted fingerprints under section 560.002(1)(a) of the Government Code.

Generally, information used or developed in an investigation of child abuse under chapter 261 of the Family Code must be withheld in its entirety under section 261.201 of the Family Code. Thus, in this instance, there is a conflict of laws between section 261.201 and section 560.002 of the Government Code. However, where information falls within both a general and a specific statutory provision, the specific provision prevails over the general. See Cuellar v. State, 521 S.W.2d 277 (Tex. Crim. App.1975) (under well-established rule of statutory construction, specific statutory provisions prevail over general ones); Open Records Decision Nos. 598 (1991), 583 (1990), 451 (1986). We find that the public availability provision of section 560.002 of the Government Code is more specific than the general confidentiality provision in section 261.201 of the Family Code. Thus, section 560.002 more specifically governs the public availability of the submitted fingerprints and prevails over the more general confidentiality provisions of section 261.201.

See Lufkin v. City of Galveston, 63 Tex. 437 (1885) (when two sections of an act apply, and one is general and the other is specific, then the specific controls); see also Gov't Code §§ 311.025(a) (if statutes enacted at same or different sessions of legislature are irreconcilable, statute latest in date of enactment prevails), 311.026 (where general statutory provision conflicts with specific provision, specific provision prevails as exception to general provision). Therefore, the district attorney must release the fingerprints to the requestor under section 560.002 of the Government Code.

In summary, (1) the arrest warrant affidavit must be released under article 15.26 of the Code of Criminal Procedure, provided that it was presented to a magistrate in support of the issuance of an arrest warrant; (2) the fingerprints must be released to the requestor under section 560.002 of the Government Code; and (3) the district attorney must withhold the remaining submitted information, including the arrest warrant affidavit if not presented to a magistrate, under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 261.201 of the Family Code. As our ruling is dispositive, we do not address your remaining arguments.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular records at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other records or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For example, governmental bodies are prohibited from asking the attorney general to reconsider this ruling. Gov't Code § 552.301(f). If the governmental body wants to challenge this ruling, the governmental body must appeal by filing suit in Travis County within 30 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.324(b). In order to get the full benefit of such an appeal, the governmental body must file suit within 10 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.353(b)(3), (c). If the governmental body does not appeal this ruling and the governmental body does not comply with it, then both the requestor and the attorney general have the right to file suit against the governmental body to enforce this ruling. *Id.* § 552.321(a).

If this ruling requires the governmental body to release all or part of the requested information, the governmental body is responsible for taking the next step. Based on the statute, the attorney general expects that, within 10 calendar days of this ruling, the governmental body will do one of the following three things: 1) release the public records; 2) notify the requestor of the exact day, time, and place that copies of the records will be provided or that the records can be inspected; or 3) notify the requestor of the governmental body's intent to challenge this letter ruling in court. If the governmental body fails to do one of these three things within 10 calendar days of this ruling, then the requestor should report that failure to the attorney general's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877)673-6839. The requestor may also file a complaint with the district or county attorney. *Id.* § 552.3215(e).

If this ruling requires or permits the governmental body to withhold all or some of the requested information, the requestor can appeal that decision by suing the governmental body. *Id.* § 552.321(a); *Texas Dep't of Pub. Safety v. Gilbreath*, 842 S.W.2d 408, 411 (Tex. App.—Austin 1992, no writ).

Please remember that under the Act the release of information triggers certain procedures for costs and charges to the requestor. If records are released in compliance with this ruling, be sure that all charges for the information are at or below the legal amounts. Questions or complaints about over-charging must be directed to Hadassah Schloss at the Texas Building and Procurement Commission at (512)475-2497.

If the governmental body, the requestor, or any other person has questions or comments about this ruling, they may contact our office. We note that a third party may challenge this ruling by filing suit seeking to withhold information from a requestor. Gov't Code § 552.325. Although there is no statutory deadline for contacting us, the attorney general prefers to receive any comments within 10 calendar days of the date of this ruling.

Sincerely,

Cindy Nettles

Assistant Attorney General Open Records Division

(1) hittes

CN/krl

Ref: ID# 217450

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Mr. Gary J. Cohen 1307 West Avenue Austin, Texas 78701 (w/o enclosures)